

Constitutional Court  
Republic of China (Taiwan)  
Reporter

**INTERPRETATIONS**

Nos. 717~759

(2014~2017)

*Translated and Published by*  
**Judicial Yuan, R.O.C. (Taiwan)**  
December 2019

Published by the Judicial Yuan  
124, Chung Ching South Road, Section 1,  
Taipei 100, Taiwan, R.O.C.  
<http://www.judicial.gov.tw/>

Kun Yi Color Reproduction Co., Ltd.  
8F.-6, No.430, Zhongzheng N. Rd.,  
Sanchong Dist., New Taipei City 241,  
Taiwan (R.O.C.)  
Tel: (+886-2)2971-8809  
Fax: (+886-2)2986-9868

1st edition, December 2019

© 2019, The Judicial Yuan  
All rights reserved  
Printed in the Republic of China  
Cover design: David Sze

Cited as

Interpretation No. \_\_\_\_\_[translated by \_\_\_\_\_]

8 R.O.C. Const. Ct (page number) (2019)

A Catalogue record for this Reporter is available from  
National Central Library, R.O.C.

ISBN 978-986-5431-30-3

## II Directory of the Translators

# Directory of the Translators

(in alphabetical order)

### **Chao-Tien CHANG (張兆恬)**

S.J.D., University of Pennsylvania

Assistant Professor, National Chiao Tung University School of Law

### **Chen-Hung CHANG (張陳弘)**

S.J.D., American University Washington College of Law

Adjunct Assistant Professor, School of Law, Soochow University

### **Ming-Woei CHANG (張明偉)**

S.J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law

Professor of Law, School of Law, Fu-Jen Catholic University

### **Chung-Lin CHEN (陳仲嶙)**

S.J.D., University of Wisconsin-Madison

Professor and Director, Institute of Law for Science and Technology, National Tsing Hua University

### **Yen-Chia CHEN (陳彥嘉)**

J.D., Indiana University

Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law, Department of Law, Aletheia University

### **Chuan-Ju CHENG (鄭川如)**

Ph.D. in Law, University of Washington

Associate Professor of Law, College of Law, Fu-Jen Catholic University

### **Chun-Yih CHENG (程春益)**

Postgraduate Studies, University of Oxford

Managing Partner, Formosa Transnational Attorneys at Law

**John Chia-Chieh CHENG (鄭家捷)**

J. D., Saint Louis University, Attorney at law, admitted in the state of New York

Associate Professor, Languages Department, National Yun Lin Univeristy

**Eleanor Y.Y. CHIN (金玉瑩)**

Ph.D., Shanghai University of Finance and Economics School of Business Administration

LL.M., Soochow University School of Law

Managing Partner, Chien Yeh Law Offices

**Chi CHUNG (鍾騏)**

S.J.D., Harvard Law School

Assistant Professor, Department of Public Finance, College of Social Sciences, National Chengchi University

**Hsiu-Yu FAN (范秀羽)**

J.S.D., University of California, Berkeley School of Law

Assistant Professor of Law, Soochow University School of Law

**Spenser Y. HOR (何曜琛)**

J.D., Southern Methodist University School of Law

Chief Counselor, Chien Yeh Law Offices

**Jimmy Chia-Shin HSU (許家馨)**

J.S.D., The University of Chicago Law School

Associate Research Professor, Institutum Iurisprudentiae, Academia Sinica

**C.Y. HUANG (黃慶源)**

S.J.D., Harvard Law School

Managing partner, Tsar & Tsai Law Firm

#### **IV Directory of the Translators**

**Ed Ming-Hui HUANG (黃銘輝)**

S.J.D., University of Wisconsin-Madison

Associate Professor of Law, Department of Law, National Taipei University

**Wei-Feng HUANG (黃偉峯)**

J.D. Tulane University

Consultant of THY Taiwan International Law Offices

**Szu-Chen KUO (郭思岑)**

LL.M., Duke University

Clerk for the Justice, Constitutional Court, Judicial Yuan

**Lawrence L. C. LEE (李禮仲)**

S.J.D., School of Law, University of Wisconsin

Associate Professor and Chief Executive Office, Chain & Franchise

Management and Legal Compliance Research Center, National Taipei

University of Business

**Yen-Chi LIU (劉晏齊)**

J.S.D., University of California, Berkeley

Assistant Professor, School of Law, Fu Jen Catholic University

**Edmund Ryden SJ (雷敦穌)**

PhD. SOAS, London University

Associate Professor, Department of Law, Fu Jen Catholic University

**Ching P SHIH (史慶璞)**

S.J.D., Golden Gate University, School of Law

Associate Professor, Chung-Yuan Christian University

**Andy Y. SUN (孫遠釗)**

J.D., University of Maryland School of Law

Visiting Professor, Peking University Law School

Executive Director, Asia Pacific Legal Institute

**Chen-En SUNG (宋承恩)**

DPhil Candidate, St Catherine's College, University of Oxford

**Robert Huai-Ching TSAI (蔡懷卿)**

J.D., University of California, Davis

Assistant Professor (retired), Hsuan Chuang University, Department of Law

# Contents

<b>Interpretation Number.....</b>	<b>Page</b>
<b>No. 717 .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Is it unconstitutional to limit the ceiling of the retirement income of public functionaries and the retirement of school teachers and staff to reduce the original amount of the deposit preferential provisions?	
<b>No. 718 .....</b>	<b>29</b>
Are the provisions of the Assembly and Demonstration Act regarding application for approval which do not exclude urgent and incidental assemblies[y] and demonstrations unconstitutional?	
<b>No. 719 .....</b>	<b>41</b>
Is the law unconstitutional to require a government procurement winning bidder hiring more than 100 employees to recruit a certain percentage of indigenous people, and to make the substituting payment for failing to comply?	
<b>No. 720 .....</b>	<b>57</b>
Before revision of the Detention Act, what judicial remedies are available for a detainee who disagrees with a decision of the detention house in a grievance proceeding?	
<b>No. 721 .....</b>	<b>63</b>
Are the provisions setting forth the Single Electoral Constituency with Two Votes System for legislator elections, the number of seats of political party representatives, and the 5% threshold for political parties therein unconstitutional?	
<b>No.722 .....</b>	<b>77</b>
Is the relevant provision of Regulations Governing Business Income from Professional Practice which only permits the adoption of accrual	



accounting for professional joint practitioners or professional associations collecting and disbursing on behalf of members unconstitutional?

**No. 723** .....88

Is it unconstitutional to promulgate regulations to prescribe the two-year period for declaring National Health Insurance Medical Service Points?

**No. 724** .....98

Is the provision of the Enforcement Regulations for the Supervision and Guidance of Civil Association of All Levels which specifies that the directors and supervisors of a civil association which has been set a time limit for correction shall cease exercising their powers and authorities unconstitutional?

**No. 725** .....107

An Interpretation that declares a statute or regulation unconstitutional but invalid only after a period of time currently has no effect on cases for which the Interpretation was sought. Is this unconstitutional?

**No. 726** .....119

Is a separate labor-management agreement for working hours and other issues without filing with the competent authority still subject to the restrictions under the Labor Standards Act?

**No. 727** .....134

Is the rule that authorizes the competent authority to nullify the resident certificates and related rights and interests of resident military householders who disagree with the reconstruction of old military dependents' villages unconstitutional?

**No. 728** .....150

Is the relevant provision of the Statutes Governing Ancestor Worship Guilds that guilds existing prior to the promulgation of the Statutes, whether a person is a qualified successor to the guild should be determined by its internal regulations constitutional?

## VIII

<b>No. 729</b> .....	162
Can the Legislative Yuan request investigation files held by the Prosecution?	
<b>No. 730</b> .....	181
Is Article 19, Section 2 of the Implementing Regulations of the Act Governing the Retirement of Public School Teachers and Employees unconstitutional?	
<b>No. 731</b> .....	195
If the portion of the Contested Requirement, which stipulates that those who wish to apply for compensation in land in lieu of cash “shall within the period of the public announcement of the expropriation” submit their application, is unconstitutional, because the date of the public announcement of the expropriation is used to calculate the period during which individuals who are served a written notice of expropriation issued after that date may apply?	
<b>No. 732</b> .....	205
Is it unconstitutional that the provisions at issue allow competent authorities to expropriate adjacent lands, which are not necessarily required for transportation, in accordance with applicable laws for the purpose of land development?	
<b>No. 733</b> .....	222
Does the Section 2 of Article 17 of the Civil Associations Act regarding “A chair person shall be elected from the standing directors by the vote of directors and, if no such position of standing directors is set, then selection shall be made by the vote among the directors.” violate the Constitution?	
<b>No. 734</b> .....	231
The Waste Disposal Act authorizes competent authorities to publish the types of act which could be characterized as an act of environmental pollution. Is it consistent with the Constitution to regard the official notices published thereunder, recognizing the unapproved placement of advertisements in designated areas and by a designated	

manner as an act of pollution?	
<b>No. 735</b> .....	243
Is a no-confidence motion stipulated under Article 3, Paragraph 2, Subparagraph 3 of the Amendments to the Constitution of the Republic of China permitted to be proposed during an extraordinary session of the Legislative Yuan convened due to other specific matters?	
<b>No. 736</b> .....	251
1. Is Article 33 of the Teachers' Act unconstitutional?	
2. Is the teacher who claims that his/her rights or legal interests are infringed by the school's concrete measures entitled to file a lawsuit?	
<b>No. 737</b> .....	260
Is it unconstitutional that the criminal suspect and his or her counsel only have access to factual issues cited in the detention motion at investigatory stage according to Article 33 Paragraph 1 and Article 101 Paragraph 3 of the Criminal Procedure Code?	
<b>No. 738</b> .....	280
1. Is it constitutional for Point 2, Section 1, Subsection 1 of the Operating Procedures on the Issuance of Electronic Gaming Arcade Classification Identification for the Electronic Gaming Industry to stipulate that the operating facilities of electronic gaming arcades shall be in compliance with the Self-governing Ordinance?	
2. Is it constitutional for Article 5, Paragraph 1, Section 2 of the Taipei City Electronic Gaming Arcades Installation and Management Self-governing Ordinance, Article 4, Paragraph 1 of the Taipei County Electronic Gaming Arcades Installation Self-governing Ordinance (now invalid), and Article 4, Paragraph 1 of the Taoyuan County Electronic Gaming Arcades Installation Self-governing Ordinance (continuously in effect as of December 25, 2014 by promulgation) to respectively regulate that an electronic gaming arcade should maintain a distance of 1,000, 990 or 800 meters away from certain locations?	

**No. 739** .....302

Is the requirement set forth in Article 8, Paragraph 1 of the Regulation for Encouraging Landowners to Handle Urban Land Consolidation (hereinafter “the Encouraging Consolidation Regulation”) to apply for the approval of organizing a preparatory committee by the initiators constitutional? Are the provisions set forth in Article 9, Subparagraph 3 and Article 20, Paragraph 1 of the Regulation which mandate that the preparatory committee shall apply for the approval of the proposed consolidation range, Article 9, Subparagraph 6 and Article 26, Paragraph 1 of the same Regulation which mandate that the preparatory committee shall apply for the approval of the consolidation project, publicly announce, and notify to the landowners constitutional? Are the procedures under the same Regulation regarding that the competent authorities approve the proposed consolidation range and grant a permission to implement the consolidation project constitutional? Is the ratio for reaching an agreement set forth in Article 58, Paragraph 3 of the Equalization of Land Rights Act constitutional?

**No. 740** .....326

Whether a service contract for the solicitation of insurance business between an insurance solicitor and the insurance company to which the solicitor belongs is a labor contract under Article 2 Sub-paragraph 6 of the Labor Standards Act?

**No. 741** .....341

When an individual applies to this Court for an Interpretation of the Constitution and this Court declares a statute or regulation that has been applied by the court of last instance in its final judgment or ruling to be unconstitutional but invalid only after expiry of a prescribed period of time, may the applicant rely on the Interpretation rendered by this Court to seek a retrial of the case or other redress? May the Prosecutor General rely on the Interpretation rendered by this Court to make an extraordinary appeal?

<b>No. 742</b> .....	352
Is it permitted to challenge by filing an administrative appeal or initiating court proceedings in an administrative court a specific part of an urban plan modification based on a periodic Comprehensive Review of the urban plan, if that specific part either directly restricts the rights and privileges of specific individuals within a certain region or of an identifiable group of individuals, or imposes additional obligations on such individuals?	
<b>No. 743</b> .....	369
Whether lands expropriated for the mass rapid transit system may be used for joint development plan?	
<b>No. 744</b> .....	383
Are Article 24, Paragraph 2 of the Statute for Control of Hygiene and Safety of Cosmetics and its punishment as provided in Article 30, Paragraph 1 of the same Statute unconstitutional?	
<b>No. 745</b> .....	395
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Is it unconstitutional to disallow earners of salary income to deduct the full amount of their expenses?</li> <li>2. The letter ruling issued by the Ministry of Finance characterizes the hourly pay earned by adjunct university teachers as salary income rather than as income earned by a practitioner. Is this letter ruling a violation of the constitutional principle of taxation in accordance with the law?</li> </ol>	
<b>No. 746</b> .....	412
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Both Article 20 of the Tax Collection Act and Article 51, Section 1 of the Estate and Gift Tax Act impose a failure-to-pay surcharge on the taxes payable but not paid on time. Are these provisions unconstitutional?</li> <li>2. Ministry of Finance Letter of Tai-Tsai-Shui No.790445422 (April 8, 1991) and Letter of Tai-Tsai-Shui No. 811680291 (October 9, 1992) hold that, if a taxpayer files an administrative appeal against the amount of additional taxes payable as determined by the peti-</li> </ol>	

## XII

tion decision but does not pay one-half of such taxes until after the payment deadline, a failure-to-pay surcharge shall be imposed for that half of the taxes. Are these two Letters unconstitutional?

3. Article 51, Paragraph 2 of the Estate and Gift Tax Act provides that the interests on the taxes payable and the failure-to-pay surcharges shall accrue from the next day of the payment deadline. Is it unconstitutional?

### **No. 747** .....433

Does the landowner have the right to request the user of his or her land to apply for expropriation of the land surface right to the competent authority, if that party carries out road construction by tunneling under or passing over the land to the extent that goes beyond the scope of social responsibility that the owner may be expected to bear, resulting in special sacrifice on the landowner?

### **No. 748** .....450

Do the provisions of Chapter 2 on Marriage of Part IV on Family of the Civil Code, which do not allow two persons of the same sex to create a permanent union of intimate and exclusive nature for the purpose of living a common life, violate constitution's guarantees of freedom of marriage under Article 22 and right to equality under Article 7?

### **No. 749** .....482

Are the provisions in the Road Traffic Management and Penalty Act that disqualify a taxi driver who was convicted of certain crimes during the time period for professional practice for a fixed period of three years and that revoke all categories of driving license held unconstitutional?

### **No. 750** .....508

Are the provisions that require a graduate from an overseas department of dentistry to successfully complete training in clinical practice at a medical institution accredited by the competent authorities so as to be eligible to take part in a dentist examination unconstitutional?

**No. 751** .....532

1. Article 26, Paragraph 2 of the Administrative Penalty Act stipulates that an administrative penalty may be imposed on top of a final disposition of conditional deferred prosecution. Is it a violation of the Constitution? Article 45, Paragraph 3 of the same Act provides that a payment made [for a conditional deferred prosecution] may be deducted from the penalty on an offense committed before the 2011 Amendment of the same Act but yet to be punished. Is it a violation of the Ex Post Facto principle or the doctrine of legitimate expectation?
2. Does [the old version of] Article 26, Paragraph 2 of the Administrative Penalty Act, which took effect on February 5, 2006, apply to a final disposition of conditional deferred prosecution?

**No. 752** .....574

Cases which are listed under the Code of Criminal Procedure, Article 376, Clause 1 and 2:

1. Is it unconstitutional for a case to be not appealable to the court of third instance if the case is first pronounced guilty in the court of first instance but is later overruled on appeal or where the judgement is revoked and the accused is pronounced guilty in the court of second instance?
2. Is it unconstitutional for a case to be not appealable to the court of third instance if the case is first pronounced not guilty in the court of first instance but is later overruled on appeal or where the judgement is revoked and the accused is pronounced guilty in the court of second instance?

**No. 753** .....590

1. Does the Gesetzesvorbehalt principle apply to the contract with the National Health Insurance Healthcare Providers? Do the relevant provisions of the National Health Insurance Act authorizing the Competent Authority to issue Regulations Governing Contracting and Management of National Health Insurance Medical Care Insti-

tutions (“Contracting and Management Regulations”) violate the principle of clarity and definiteness of statutory authorization?

2. Are provisions of the abovementioned Contracting and Management Regulations concerning contract suspension, refusal of reimbursement, offsets of the period of suspended contract, and deductions of medical expenses exceed the scope of authorization by the enabling statute?
3. Do provisions of the abovementioned Contracting and Management Regulations concerning contract suspension, refusal of reimbursement, and offsets of the period of suspended contract violate the principle of proportionality under the Constitution?

**No. 754** .....625

Does filing one import declaration form to evade import duty, commodity tax, and business tax constitute one single conduct or multiple conducts? Do the combined penalties for the tax evasions violate the principle of double jeopardy embraced by a rule-of-law nation?

**No. 755** .....638

According to Article 6 of the Prison Act and Article 5, Paragraph 1, Subparagraph 7 of its Enforcement Rules, inmates are not allowed to seek remedies in court. Does the foregoing contradict Article 16 of the Constitution, which protects people’s right to institute legal proceedings?

**No. 756** .....659

1. Does Article 66 of the Prison Act violate the right to privacy of correspondence protected under Article 12 of the Constitution?
2. Do Subparagraphs 1, 2 and 7, Article 82 of the Enforcement Rules of the Prison Act exceed the authorization of the enabling statute, namely the Prison Act?
3. Does Paragraph 3, Article 81 of the Enforcement Rules of the Prison Act violate the principle of legal reservation in Article 23 and freedom of expression in Article 11 of the Constitution?



<b>No. 757</b> .....	681
Whether the Applicant of J.Y. Interpretation No. 706 can directly use the payment receipt issued by the Execution Court as input tax certificate?	
<b>No. 758</b> .....	693
Should a case filed by a landowner pursuant to Article 767, Paragraph 1 of the Civil Code be a dispute arising from a relationship in private law to be adjudicated by ordinary courts, not being influenced by the fact that the means of attack and defense of the two parties involve disputes arising from a relationship in public law?	
<b>No. 759</b> .....	699
Which court shall adjudicate disputes where surviving relatives of staff employed by the former Taiwan Provincial Water Supply Company Ltd. claim survivors' compensation?	
<b>Index</b> .....	710
Relative Laws or Regulations .....	710
Keywords .....	775
Translators .....	847